

SECRET
S/18
मार्ग संख्या
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

फाइल सं.
File No.

0/551/8/80-SP

खंड
Volume

मन्त्रालय
Ministry of

External Affairs
विदेश संसाधन
कार्यालय

Department
Office

East Asia Division
विनायक
SECTION

..... को सूची द्वारा की गई
Indexed on

आवश्यक
Initials

टिप्पणियाँ/पत्राचार
NOTES/CORRESPONDENCE

4 — 11

विषय
Subject

Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose - Papers
regarding return of Ashes to India from Japan.

संग्रहीत का वा
Record A/B

अभिलेख ग... में नष्ट की जाए
Record C. Destroy in

अनुभागीय नोट बुक में नोट किया जाए
नोट न किया जाए

To be
Note to be noted In Sectional Note Book

अनु० अ०/अधीक्षक के जावशार
Initials of S. O./Supdt.

लिपिक के जावशार
Initials of Clerk

P. S. Bhambhani
अनुभाग अधिकारी (ई.ए.)
Section Officer (EA)
विदेश मन्त्रालय, नई दिल्ली
Ministry of External Affairs
New Delhi

Keep
File
162/1995
PARASER

पिछले हवाले
Previous References

0/125/17/70-SP

SCANNED

बाद के हवाले
Later References

DECLASSIFIED

32726

एस० 97 (अविरंगनाम)/आ० ए० ए०-५८
S. 97 (Unbleached)/O. & M-58.

प्रभासमूठक-105-19 जनरल एडमिन/73-74-भासमूठक-(सी-96)-12-2-76-50,00,000.

GIPTC-105-19 General Adm./73-74-GIPTC-(C-96)-12-2-76-50,00,000.

गौतम गुप्ता
(GAUTAM GUPTA)
उप हाईक (ए पर अप्र.एम.)
Dy. Secretary (A.P.M.)
विदेश मन्त्रालय, नई दिल्ली
Ministry of External Affairs
New Delhi

Secret

Ministry of External Affairs
(East Asia Division)

Placed below is a letter from Mr. Tatsuo Hayashida, a former Japanese Army officer, to the Prime Minister. Mr. Tatsuo Hayashida mentions that he escorted the ashes of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Taipei to Tokyo and pleads that arrangements may please be made for the return of the ashes to India. PM has noted: "I agree but the Forward Bloc will oppose vehemently and others may join".

2. Secretary (East) is fully aware of the background to this problem. Some years ago all papers relating to this problem were transferred to the Ministry of Home Affairs and they handle all Parliamentary questions etc. on the subject.

3. When we were in Tokyo recently the Embassy officials pointed out that the problem has taken a new dimension arising from the fact that all people in Japan who venerated Netaji and are looking after the ashes are now very old. While the priest in the temple may be happy to continue receiving subsidy from the Government of India for maintaining the ashes, it may become progressively more difficult to do this in a manner befitting Netaji.

newman
(V.C. Khanna)
Director (EA)
15.7.80

Secretary (East)

Recd. discuss
15/7/80

Pl. *discuss*
Letter returned to PM's Office.

re
15/7

Pl. discuss
Work Pl. resolved with S.A.F.
re

re *re*

Resubmitter. A self-explanatory note on the subject, prepared in MHA in December 1978 in connection with a Rajya Sabha question, is at Pl. x.

re Chaudhury

15.7.80

DS (EA) 15/7/80

Dir (EA)

Pl. S.P.

re *re*

re 15/7/80

re *re*

1605/160/80 2357/Dir(EA)/80
26/11 SECRETARY, 17/11
MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS
NEW DELHI

6671 17/11 80

R. 9
F.M. had suggested that
question might be informally
discussed with some members
of P.L. before we took this
any further.

2. He says it may be better to
wait for another 3-4 weeks and
see the news in Parliament. We
may raise this again around 15/12.

4.
17/11

~~Dir(EA)~~ Pl. sp
ue

CLERK

DS/EA) 17 for 15 Dec 80.

568/DS(EA)/80
No. 1029-44/5X-80
26/11

US (PKM)
On behalf
of
S. K. 26/11

1600/160/80/1812

Reference above.

2. Secretary(East) had suggested that this matter
could be raised again after 15th December. Relevant
papers pertaining to the question of Netaji's ashes
are placed below.

S. S. Gill
Deputy Secretary(EA)
24.12.80

Dir(EA)

Discussed with
DS (EA). Pl. papers
on 10-3-81
S. K.
18/12

I have discussed this with Sec(EA).
We can keep leading on the moment.
The intention was for 24 to discuss
the matter with the members of the
Consultative Committee at 10. Next meeting
how we will want.

27/12 1980 S. K. 27/12 1980

PL 27/12 1980
S. K.

Ministry of E.A.
East Asia Div.

(3)

US(S) wishes to see these
papers.

33281/81
10/4/81

2. The Report on the Envelope
and the Note for Supplements
prepared by MTA, about which
I spoke to US(S), are at Page
X.

3. We shall be grateful if
the file is returned to us urgently.

DR Clark

15. 4. 81
US(JKM)

US(S)

US(S) may pls. see the Note for
Supplements at X.

Dr. No. 2120 IJS (S) 81
Dated 15.4.81

IJS(S)

DR Clark
15/4

seen; thanks.

US(S)

US(JKM)

DR Clark
15/4
16/4

DR Clark
15/4

Reference notes on Page 9 ante
pertaining to the bringing of Netaji's ashes
from Japan to India, JS(EA) has recorded
that, after discussions with Secy (S), the
matter is to be brought up possibly at the
time of the next Consultative Committee meeting
when FM would like the to discuss the
matter with the members.

Secy (S) may like to see as to
whether it can be discussed at the
meeting scheduled for 13-14 July at Hyderabad.

Secy
Off
1971
14 July

Secy (East)

I mention this to FM. He
said it could wait a little longer
14 July

Pl retain in Section and put again before
next Consultative Committee meeting.

SO

Off
14 July

6206/15AD/81
13/7/71

Mr. 14
Pl 14

2

SECRET

POSITION IN THE
ADMITTED LIST

STARRED QUESTION NO. 468
IN THE RAJYA SABHA FOR 21.12.78

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

The question reads as under:-

- (a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a news item which appeared in the Times of India of the 5th December, 1978 regarding the suggestion made by a retired General of the Japanese Imperial Army, who is the custodian of the ashes of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, to the effect that the ashes should be handed over to the Government of India; and
- (b) if so, whether the Government of India propose to take up the matter with the Government of Japan?

1. The news item referred to in the question is annexed. It refers to the suggestion made by General Fujwara custodian of the ashes said to be of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose stored in the Renkoji Shrine near Tokyo. The statement was reportedly made to a Malaysian lawyer, connected with the Ex-INA personnel in Malaysia. The circumstances in which the statement was made and released to the Press are not known.

2. In April, 1956, the Government of India, in response to public demand, appointed an Inquiry Committee consisting of Sarvashri Shah Nawaz Khan, Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose) and S.N.Maitra,

Contd.....2..

formerly Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar, to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's alleged death in an air-crash. Two members of the Committee, namely, Sarvashri Shah Nawaz Khan and S.N.Maitra, came to the conclusion that Netaji met his death in an air-crash at Taihoku (Formosa) on the 18th August, 1945. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose disagreed with these findings and submitted a dissenting report. The majority report was accepted by the Government.

3. The controversy over the disappearance of Netaji was, however, not resolved and demands continued to be made for undertaking another inquiry into the matter. Rumours about Netaji's survival and his subsequent appearance elsewhere cropped up repeatedly. In response to a demand for a fresh inquiry by a number of Members of Parliament belonging to different political parties, the Government decided to appoint a Commission of Inquiry to go into the entire matter in July, 1970. Shri G.D.Khosla, retired Chief Justice of Punjab High Court, was appointed as a one man Commission to "inquire into all the facts and circumstances relating to the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in 1945 and the subsequent developments

Contd.....3..

connected therewith and make a report to the Central Government". The Commission visited Japan, Burma, Thailand, Singapore, Malaysia, South Vietnam and Formosa (Taiwan) and examined 224 witnesses including 100 who were examined abroad. A large number of files and documents were produced and cited in evidence. The Commission submitted its report on the 30th June, 1974. The Commission arrived at the same conclusion that was reached by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee in 1956 that Netaji died in an air-crash at Taihoku on the 18th August, 1945.

4. The Cabinet accepted the finding that Netaji had died in an air-crash on the 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku in Taiwan. The report of the Commission alongwith the memorandum of action taken thereon was laid on the Tables of both the Houses of Parliament on 3rd September, 1974.

5. The Khosla Commission in its Report had mentioned that

"(xviii) Two days later, Bose's body was cremated and his ashes were carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September, 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji Temple".

6. The Commission did not make any specific recommendation or suggestions for bringing the ashes to India and it was not also a point of reference to the Commission. While submitting the Report for approval

of the Cabinet before placing it in Parliament, a point was raised that the Government might have to take a stand on the question of bringing the ashes to India this it was not pursued.

7. The controversy did not, however, end with the publication of the Khosla Commission Report. On the 3rd August, 1977, Shri Samar Guha moved a motion in the Lok Sabha suggesting inter-alia the setting up a three-man Commission for conducting a fresh inquiry into the mystery of disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

8. The motion was discussed at length in 1977 and also in 1978. On the 28th August, 1978 the Prime Minister intervening in the debate observed

"There have been two enquiries into the report of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in the air-crash on 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku airfield during his air-journey to Manchuria, one by a Committee presided over by Maj. General Shah Nawaz Khan and the second by a one-man Commission of Inquiry headed by Shri G.D. Khosla, retired Judge of the Punjab High Court. The majority report of the first Committee and Shri Khosla held the report of the death as true. Since then, reasonable doubts have been cast on the correctness of the conclusions reached in the two reports and various important contradictions in the testimony of witnesses have been noticed. Some further contemporary official documentary records have also become available. In the light

Contd....5..

of those doubts and contradictions and those records Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions are decisive. At the same time Government feels that no useful purpose would be served by having any further inquiry. I hope that in the light of this statement my hon. friend will withdraw his motion".

Thereafter Prof. Guha withdrew his motion. While doing so he declared in the House

"Today, I cannot express my gratitude to the Prime Minister because today ends a crusade that in my humble way I was trying to conduct on behalf of the people of India at least to see that officially and legally Netaji is not declared dead".

9. The authenticity of the ashes kept in the Renkoji Temple in Japan as those of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose has not therefore been finally established. It will be rather premature to think of receiving the ashes in India and build a suitable memorial for storing them at this stage. This Question can be considered only after the mystery surrounding the disappearance of Netaji in 1945 is finally cleared. As indicated by Prime Minister in the House the Government do not at present contemplate any fresh inquiry into this matter.

Contd....6...

10. Indian Embassy, Tokyo have reported to the Ministry of External Affairs that as far as the Embassy officials are aware FUJIWARA has not made any such statements in Japan. He is also not the custodian of Netaji's ashes which are kept in Renkoji Shrine in Japan. A Malaysian citizen Karam Singh Veeria visited Japan in October 1978 and met FUJIWARA. He is reported to be of doubtful antecedents and despite his claims has no known links with INA. The Embassy has reported that the statements referred to in the press report have presumably been made by him. The Embassy has also reported that some Japanese associated with INA have privately expressed the desire to see Netaji's ashes ultimately returned to India and FUJIWARA may be one of them.

(8)

ANNEXURE

"Netaji's Ashes Must Be Given to India"

KUALALUMPUR Dec. 4 - General Fujiwara of the Japanese Imperial Army, custodian of the ashes of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose, has suggested that the ashes should be ceremoniously handed over to the Indian Government reports PTI.

The ageing General expressed this wish to a Malaysian lawyer, Mr. V. Karan Singh who went to Japan recently to pay homage to the Netaji memorial.

He went there on behalf of the ex-INA personnel in Malaysia and Singapore.

Netaji's ashes are kept in an urn at the Renkoji shrine near Tokyo under the care of the chief monk, Matsusuke, for the past 35 years.

Netaji's Ashes.

[The Note for Supplementaries prepared by the Ministry of Home Affairs in response to a Rajya Sabha Question in December 1978 which gives the background to the Question is placed below.

2.] In summary, following is the position :-

- (i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- (ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- (iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- (iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shahnawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

3. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

4. For F.M.'s information only: We give annually about Rs.20,000 to the temple authorities to enable them to continue to look after the ashes. All matters pertaining to Netaji's death are now dealt with by Ministry of Home Affairs.

-3-

(16)

Netaji's Ashes

In summary, following is the position:

- i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shahnawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

2. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

3. When this had been placed before FM, he had suggested that it might be desirable to have some informal consultation with Members of Parliament. Perhaps the meeting of the Consultative Committee might possibly provide an opportunity for this.

(1)

Netaji's Ashes

In summary, following is the position:

- i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shahnawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

2. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

3. When this had been placed before FM, he had suggested that it might be desirable to have some informal consultation with Members of Parliament. Perhaps the meeting of the Consultative Committee might possibly provide an opportunity for this.